

**FACULTY SENATE MEETING** – Approved 3/7/19  
**Minutes of Meeting of February 14, 2019**  
Jack and Florence Ferman Presentation Room

Faculty President Stein called the meeting to order at 2:00 p.m.

The Secretary called the roll. Senators not present were: Michael Bennett (excused), Sara Berzenski (excused), Nazaret Dermendjian (excused), David Edelstein (excused), Monica Garcia, Christopher Higgs (excused), Ellen Jarosz (excused), Peri Klemm (excused), Jason Lo (excused), N'Sengha Mutombo, Lissa Stapleton, Adam Swenson (excused), Gina Umeck

The Faculty [Senate Minutes December 6, 2018](#) were approved as revised.

## 1. Announcements

- a. Senator Henige said that she sent an email a few days ago encouraging Senators to use *NameCoach* to record their names on the Senate Canvas page. Using *NameCoach* will help ensure that names are pronounced correctly for roll call.
- b. Senator Wayne Smith shared that there is a unique learning opportunity on March 8-9, on campus for faculty called "Reacting to the Past" (RTTP). It is hosted by Beth Wightman from the Department of English and the Office of Undergraduate Studies. RTTP originated from Barnard College of Columbia University. It's a "gamified", interactive, pedagogical approach to Humanities-related subject matter that has proven to be valuable in the classroom. The plan is to host 2-3 faculty members from each campus across the CSU. The flyer was sent via email to all Senators. Flyers were also placed on the back table at the Senate meeting. Senator Smith requested that all interested faculty members RSVP ASAP. Game materials will be mailed out on February 18, 2019.
- c. Senator Ntagu announced that Elections for Associated Students will start on February 18, 2019 and will close on March 4, 2019. If faculty members know of any students interested in running for open positions, have them contact the Associated Students Office. Senator Ntagu encouraged anyone with questions to contact her.

## 2. President's Report – President Dianne F. Harrison

President Harrison shared that she was glad to join the Senate for their first spring meeting of 2019. She advised that we learned on Tuesday that a part time physician at the Klotz Student Health Center, Dr. Dennis Kelly, is under investigation for inappropriate conduct while working at USC and six former students have filed a lawsuit against him. CSUN is unaware of any complaints from the CSUN community. The safety and health of CSUN students is a top priority and CSUN takes allegations of sexual assault, harassment and battery very seriously. CSUN will be conducting its own investigation using an attorney

from the Attorney General's Office. Dr. Kelly was placed on immediate administrative leave on Tuesday, while the review is being conducted. Anyone with any concerns regarding their interaction with this position is encouraged to contact the CSUN Office of Equity and Diversity. Information about this announcement is posted on the CSUN website so that members of the campus community can come forward if they have concerns.

President Harrison shared that for 2019-2020, Governor Newsom has proposed an increase in the budget for the CSU system. It will only cover mandatory costs for employee compensation, health premiums and utilities. The CSU system was provided with 2% for new enrollment growth funding, even though they asked for 5%. Student Success and GI 2025 funds were received but not at the level requested. The request was made for \$75 million and the governor recommended \$45 million. There was also a \$15 million, one-time allocation of funds for student housing and food insecurity and \$247 million in one-time deferred maintenance funding. The actual need is \$3 billion for deferred maintenance expenses for the CSU system. The Statewide Academic Senate, CFA, CSSA and the CSU all need to work together to advocate for additional funding for the CSU. Instead of just requesting the money and making the case for the need for more money they will be using a new strategy to secure funding - California needs more degrees! It is estimated that the state of California will be one million college degrees short by 2030. The CSU has offered to fill that gap but needs the funding to take in additional students and help them obtain degrees. President Harrison asked Interim Provost Stella Theodoulou to speak briefly about the 2018-19 budget in Academic Affairs for clarification on what was in the Sundial article earlier this week.

Interim Provost Stella Theodoulou shared that there is a structural deficit and reductions were necessary. Deans were not instructed to automatically cancel classes, but given the discretion to make choices as appropriate to the circumstances and in alignment with the necessary budget reductions. Deans were told that in 2017-18 the cost of low enrolled classes in the Academic Affairs division was \$2.5 million and that some of the 2.5% reduction could be met through reducing the number of low enrolled classes. The CSU system, through the Chancellors Office, has minimum class enrollments. Deans were told to remind their chairs that each year they have to justify their low enrolled classes. The requirement for the last 10 years has been 10 for a graduate class, 15 for an upper division class and 20 for a lower division class. Deans were informed that if they chose to have low enrolled classes that was their choice. However, if a class was at less than 80% of the minimum enrollment caps it would be subject to a charge (which would be if it was under 8, 12, 16). In addition and based upon a justification, some classes will be exempt from the charge (i.e. if needed for graduation of students, if the only capstone, only offered once a year, part of a one year or two year cycle).

President Harrison thanked the Faculty Senate for their work with students. The average unit load for students continues to rise. In fall 2018 the average unit load was 12.77 for all undergraduates (it was 12.6 units in the fall of 2017). For new first time freshman the average unit load was 14.03 units (up from 13.79 units in the fall of 2017). The six year graduation rate for fall of 2012, first time freshman cohort was 53.8%. This is up from 51.3%. The goal is to have a 60% first time freshman graduation rate by 2025.

President Harrison said that Interim Provost Theodoulou will share information about the

math results in her Provost report. President Harrison thanked the Math Department for supporting the success of CSUN students and said that their work is showing positive results.

President Harrison shared that she enjoyed the conversation she had with faculty at the conclusion of her remarks at the Faculty Retreat on cell phone usage. After the retreat, she read an article from the Chronicle of Higher Education on the topic. President Harrison said that technology is a part of students' lives and she appreciates the faculty that are incorporating technology in their classrooms and their pedagogy. President Harrison encouraged Senators to review her Faculty Retreat Address on the Faculty Senate website (on the Faculty Retreat page) and on the President's Office website. President Harrison thanked Faculty President Mary-Pat Stein and the Faculty Retreat Committee for organizing the retreat.

President Harrison also thanked the faculty, staff and students for their understanding and flexibility during the challenging events that occurred prior to and during finals week. President Harrison also thanked the faculty in the departments that were creative in finding alternative ways to give their finals. CSUN police and law enforcement (including the FBI) believe the intent of the person or persons responsible was to disrupt the administration of final exams. To ensure the wellbeing of the CSUN campus community we have to treat all threats seriously. CSUN police are continuing their investigation and will keep everyone apprised of any updates. These events highlight the importance of planning, updating, improving emergency and business continuity plans. President Harrison encouraged everyone to be prepared and plan for future threats. Deans will be engaging with faculty to seek their ideas about threat and disaster preparedness for classes and during finals.

The Chief Diversity Officer, Natalie Mason-Kinsey will be leading an up-stander campaign to engage the campus on combating hate. More information will be shared soon on the program called "Not on Our Campus". President Harrison also mentioned that she was proud of the campus community for helping contribute to the Matador Relief Fund to help individuals affected by the wildfires.

President Harrison briefly discussed the Statewide GE Taskforce Report that Faculty President Stein sent to Senators on Wednesday. She mentioned that it is being circulated for feedback and encouraged faculty to submit feedback.

The Board of Trustees approved CSUN's nomination of Susan Burton for the Honorary Doctor of Humane Letters. Susan is a community activist, community organizer and founder of A New Way of Life Re-Entry project that helps provide opportunities for formerly incarcerated women. Susan has also worked with CSUN faculty and students on the Revolutionary Scholars program for formerly incarcerated students. Susan will be honored at the commencement ceremonies for the College of Humanities and the College of Health and Human Development on Monday May 20, 2019.

The Provost Search is being chaired by Colin Donahue, Vice President for Business and Finance. The committee has completed their final round of interviews and plans to bring three to four candidates to campus for interviews with the campus community, the week of February 23 and March 3. More information will be shared as we get closer to the interview

dates. President Harrison encouraged faculty to provide feedback on the candidates.

President Harrison also introduced the new Chief of Police Greg Murphy who was in attendance at the meeting. Police Chief Murphy has extensive experience in law enforcement. In addition to serving as the Assistant Chief of Police at UC San Diego, Chief Murphy has served at UC Davis, Sierra Community College, the Los Angeles Police Department, and the California Commission on Police Officer Standards and Training (POST).

President Harrison briefly discussed the importance of the Higher Education Reauthorization Act and how it affects student financial aid. Current discussions include simplifying the FAFSA, having employers involved in loan repayments (deducting loan payments from paychecks that would not exceed 10% of earnings) and changing the federal definition of a student to include more than first-time freshmen. Fifty percent of CSUN students (transfer and part-time students) are not included because of the current federal definition. President Harrison also shared that there is new Title IX guidance from the Department of Education that is in the feedback period. CSUN is anticipating significant changes in Title IX.

President Harrison also briefly shared information on a conference she attended on disaster preparedness at CSUN and encouraged the campus to be prepared for any type of emergency. President Harrison congratulated Biology Professor Jonathan Kelber who was named a 2019-2020 Fulbright scholar for his cancer research, and the Department of Africana Studies for celebrating their 50<sup>th</sup> Anniversary. Faculty President Stein requested that President Harrison take questions via email due to the packed agenda. A Senator expressed concerns regarding student performance in mathematics and President Harrison explained that Interim Provost Theodoulou would give an update on student performance in mathematics during her report.

### **3. Faculty Elections: Nominations for Faculty Officers, Statewide Academic Senators, Senators-at-Large and Standing Committee Representative**

Spring 2019 faculty elections will be held in March for faculty officers, a CSU Statewide Academic Senator, and Senators-at-Large. Nominations were taken for these positions and additional nominations will be taken by petition. Recommendations for Senate-elected positions on the Standing Committees were also taken. The Senate Office will contact the nominees to see if they are willing to run for these positions and share the Standing Committee recommendations with the Senate Executive Committee. The Senate Executive Committee will finalize the ballots at its 2/28/19 meeting. The elections will be held in March.

### **4. Pending Business**

#### **a. Motion of No Confidence in Chancellor White**

William Garrow, Deaf Studies

Gina Masequesmay, Asian American Studies

Kathryn Sorrells, Communication Studies

Professor Kathryn Sorrells mentioned that the purpose of this motion is to vote on the competency of Chancellor White and his ability to do his job. Professor Sorrells said that Chancellor White has not been effective in policy-making (EO1110 and EO1100R), is non-consultative, is taking away faculty governance and has created structural barriers to student

success. President Stein opened the floor for discussion.

President Stein mentioned that an email was received from Senator Swenson (who was unable to attend the meeting) with suggested amendments to the resolution. President Stein explained that there is no proxy voting and if a Senator would like to make a motion and share Senator Swenson's suggestions they can.

A Senator made a motion to update the 4<sup>th</sup> clause to "without providing ANY data". It was seconded and passed. A Senator made a motion to not use all caps for the word "ANY". A Senator made a motion to strike the word "ANY". It was seconded and passed. A Senator made motion to strike the 5<sup>th</sup> clause. It was not seconded. A Senator made a motion to strike the 6<sup>th</sup> cause. It was seconded. The Senate discussed non-disclosed data, the executive orders and ethics. The Senate voted and the motion did not pass. In the 9<sup>th</sup> clause, a Senator made a motion to strike the quotation remarks around the word "save". It was seconded and passed. A Senator made a motion to strike the 11<sup>th</sup> clause. It was seconded. A Senator explained that the Senate should not be calling for more Chancellor's Office intrusion in campus autonomy. It was also mentioned that the 11<sup>th</sup> clause does not fit in the resolution. The Senate voted and the motion passed.

A Senator made a motion to strike clause 12. It was mentioned that they were not aware of a national crisis and are not sure if it exists or has been proven. It was seconded. It was not passed. A Senator made a motion to remove the word "crisis" and replace it with the word "concern". It was seconded. The Senate discussed the word crisis and the current political climate. The Senator that made the motion, understanding the objections, asked to remove the motion. A Senator declared a point of order and the Senate voted and the motion did not pass. A Senator made a motion to get rid of "the" and add "failed his responsibility" in the 12<sup>th</sup> clause. The motion was seconded and passed. A Senator made a motion to insert the word "in" before "his responsibility". It was seconded and passed.

A Senator made a motion to strike the word "Senate" in the resolved clauses. It was seconded and passed. In the last resolved clause, a Senator referred to Senator Swenson's email and requested to add AAUP, California Chapter of the AAUP, Campaign for College Opportunity, Association of Governing Boards, Los Angeles Times and the Chronicle of Higher Education to the distribution list. A Senator also requested to provide the full name for the AAUP. The motion passed. The resolution will be updated.

A Senator made a motion to table the Motion of No Confidence in Chancellor White to the next Faculty Senate meeting. It was seconded. The Senate discussed the purpose of the resolution, potential retaliation, the budget, timing, the executive orders, student success, the Statewide Academic Senate resolutions, and the Chancellor's pending decisions. The Senate voted on the motion to table the resolution and it did not pass.

A Senator requested a paper ballot for the vote of no confidence. The Senate voted on the Resolution of No Confidence.

**MSP:** to approve the Resolution of No Confidence in Chancellor White with the requested changes. Vote was 42-13; motion passed.

(After the motion passed, a Senator explained the importance of parliamentary procedure and said that it should be a democratic process.)

Approved Resolution: [Resolution of No Confidence in Chancellor White](#)

## 5. Discussion Item: Educational Equity Committee Addressing Bias in Student Teaching Evaluation of Faculty

Marcy DeVeaux, Educational Equity Committee Chair

Michael Neubauer, Educational Equity Committee

Senator Neubauer explained that the Educational Equity Committee (EEC) has been looking into bias in student evaluations of faculty. Senator Neubauer said that research reveals that teaching evaluations show bias towards female faculty, faculty of color and gender non-conforming faculty. Senator Neubauer mentioned an article by Kristina Mitchell, *Gender Bias in Student Evaluations* and a recent case on bias in the RTP process. Senator Neubauer said that the EEC wants to start a campus-wide discussion on the purpose of student evaluations. Senator Neubauer requested for faculty to contact EEC and share their experiences with student evaluations and how they have impacted their RTP process, assignment of classes and the renewal of contracts. Senator Neubauer shared that evaluations are required as per the faculty contract and sections 600 and 700. Senator DeVeaux said that there are 85 different versions of the evaluation of faculty and EEC will be reviewing them to examine the type of questions being used. After review, EEC is going to come back to Senate and make a request to create a focus group. This will help with determining what works best for CSUN.

The Senate briefly discussed student evaluations, the RTP process, the evaluation process and mentoring. A Senator requested to have data on student evaluations from the last 5 years. A Senator requested that the information regarding the focus group be shared with all faculty. Janet Oh, Director of Institutional Research explained that they cannot share the data because it is confidential. After the evaluation season, the data summaries for each department are shared with department chairs. Janet Oh mentioned that there are currently 100 different surveys at CSUN and each department has their own survey and questions. The department personnel committees have control of the questions. Senator Neubauer said that there is plenty of scholarly literature that addresses the issue of bias in student teaching evaluation of faculty. A Senator said that EEC should create a survey and share it with faculty across campus to find out their experiences with student evaluations. Another Senator suggested that there should be a bank of metrics to measure faculty and that student voices should be involved in the process.

## 6. Senate Reports

### a. Provost's Report- Interim Provost Stella Theodoulou

1. Interim Provost Theodoulou said that there is a structural deficit across campus with the budget. All divisions are taking a 2.5% cut. Academic Affairs is taking a 2.76% cut. Deans have not been instructed to cancel low enrolled courses. Deans were instructed not to cancel classes but instead to make changes as they see fit.
2. Interim Provost Theodoulou shared that a preliminary analysis shows that the passage rates for 196QR and 196S were equivalent to the passage rates for the pre-baccalaureate classes that they replaced (Math 092, 093, 097). There was about a 59% pass rate and a 41% DFU

rate. Students that passed 196QR and 196S have 5 units of credit applicable towards graduation.

3. In Fall 2018 there was a pilot section of Math 131 for students in AMC and HUM who would have been placed in 196QR. They were required to take a Supplemental Instruction Course as a corequisite. The passage rate in the pilot group matched the passage rate of students enrolled in Math 131 who were GE ready. There was about a 90% pass rate and they are going to expand the pilot in the fall.
4. For Writing, the DFU rates have slightly increased, approximately 2.5% higher than last year. They need to be monitored. Enrollment has shifted towards the 115 course. It has a pass rate of 86% and DFU rate of 14%. Interim Provost Theodoulou has requested that the campus have a series of workshops to review the data on Math and English and assess the impact.
5. For the current WASC accreditation cycle, a steering committee has been formed with constituents across campus. The campus will be holding open forums on February 19, February 21 and February 27 to discuss the theme for WASC re-accreditation.
6. The new AVP of Student Success, Claire Oliveros recently declined her position due to personal family matters. They will be reopening the search. By Monday, Interim Provost Theodoulou will announce the Interim AVP of Faculty Affairs and Interim Dean of Humanities. Last week the search committee for the Dean of Engineering held it's first meeting.
7. A Senator inquired about the passage rates of math and English in comparison to the previous passage rates in the developmental courses. AVP Elizabeth Adams explained that the passage rates in math and English now are similar to the passage rates in the previous developmental courses. The high pass rate of 86% was questioned since faculty could have felt pressured to pass students. The Provost noted that this was actually a lower pass rate than previously (88%).

**b. Statewide Academic Senate CSU Report – Jerry Schutte**

1. Senator Schutte shared that there is a newly formed joint Committee for Technology on Online Education. Their first meeting was in late November and they will have another meeting tomorrow afternoon. On the agenda is a request for more information on who is taking online courses, how they are doing and who is teaching the online courses. They are going to aggregate data at the statewide level and disperse the information to the 23 campuses.
2. The Governor's January budget shows that the CSU received \$300 million in reoccurring funds and \$264 million in one-time funds. The May revise of the Governor's budget will give the actual numbers. They will keep advocating in Sacramento for more funding in addition to the facilities bond. The facilities bond will be on the state ballot in 2020. There is an upcoming advocacy trip in March.
3. Senator Schutte shared that there is a CSU GE Taskforce Report with many proposed changes to general education. Senator Schutte requested feedback from Senators and their constituents. Feedback should be shared with Jerry Schutte, Elizabeth Sussman or Adam Swenson.

A Senator requested to include information on teacher education on the statewide report.

A Senator requested for more students to be placed on the GE Task Force. President Stein mentioned that the GE Task Force is done meeting and their final report was given to the Statewide Academic Senate.

**Link to written report:**

[https://www.csun.edu/sites/default/files/ASCSU%20Report\\_Jan.pdf](https://www.csun.edu/sites/default/files/ASCSU%20Report_Jan.pdf)

A report was sent to the Senators for the January ASCSU plenary meeting.

**c. CFA Report – CFA President Nate Thomas**

**Link to written report:**

[https://www.csun.edu/sites/default/files/CFA%20Senate%20Report\\_Feb.pdf](https://www.csun.edu/sites/default/files/CFA%20Senate%20Report_Feb.pdf)

Nate Thomas mentioned that this semester the CFA will be starting college sessions with the faculty to see what the wish lists are for the bargaining units. There will be an official survey that will go out to faculty across the CSU. A written report was sent to the Senators.

**7. New Business**

A Senator made a motion to move that the CSUN Senate create a new bylaw to designate a permanent lecturer position on the CSUN Senate Executive Committee. The motion was seconded.

**MS:** that a current Lecturer Senator shall be appointed by the Senate Executive Committee to serve as the Lecturer Representative until the bylaw is written and accepted and the formal election is held.

Another Senator made a motion to postpone the motion to the next Faculty Senate Meeting due to time constraints. The motion was seconded. Faculty President Stein said that the motion will be Postponed until the March 7, 2019 Senate Meeting.

A Senator asked to have a discussion on whether EPC was making decisions that go around the faculty vote to not participate in the implementation of EOs. Since the meeting was over time, this question was directed to EPC Chair, Mayberry, and will be taken up at the next Faculty Senate meeting.

The meeting was adjourned at 4:33pm.

Submitted by: Kim Henige, Secretary of the Faculty and Nicole Wilson, Recording Secretary