

Guide to peer-reviewing papers

Read the introduction.

- (1) On the back of the first page of the paper, write the thesis of the paper in your own words in one sentence.
- (2) On the back of the first page of the paper, write an outline of how the paper will proceed.

Read the conclusion

- (1) On the back of the last page of the paper, write the thesis of the paper in your own words in one sentence.
- (2) On the back of the last page of the paper, write an outline of how the paper proceeded.

Read the first body paragraph

- (1) Underline the statement of the paragraph's thesis. Write 'T' next to it. If there is no thesis statement, write a 'T' with a cross through it.
- (2) Write one sentence in the margin saying what the paragraph actually concluded.
- (3) If (1) and (2) match, write 'M' next to the paragraph. If they do not, write 'M' with a cross through it.
- (4) Correct any spelling and grammar errors with standard editing marks. Write 'UG' next to any constructions that are ungrammatical.
- (5) Mark 'PV' next to any instances of passive voice.
- (6) Write 'AWK' next to any awkward sentence constructions.

Repeat for each paragraph

Look back at the whole paper

- (1) Do the theses of the paragraphs match the plans written in the introduction and conclusion?
- (2) Does the argument of the paper seem convincing for the conclusion? If not, write where it seems to fail in a couple of sentences at the end.

Return to the second paragraph

- (1) Number each premise in the argument of the paragraph. Number the subpremises with 1a, 1b, et cetera.
- (2) If the argument is valid, write 'V' in the margin. If the argument is invalid, write a 'V' with a cross through it.
- (3) Place a '~' next to the number of any premise which seems to you to be very dubious or in need of more support. Place an 'X' next to the number of any premise which seems to you to be false.